Similarities and Comparisons Between Stefan Zweig's 'Last Mass in St. Sophia's Cathedral' and Ismail Kadare's 'Saint Sophia's Church'

Naser Mrasori

Department of German Language, Faculty of Philology, University of Prishtina 'Hasan Prishtina', Prishtina, Kosova

Naim Kryeziu*

Department of German Language, Faculty of Philology, University of Prishtina 'Hasan Prishtina', Prishtina, Kosova

Abstract—Zweig's contribution in Albanian literature comes from the effort of well-known Albanian intellectuals and translators, which in turn has inspired and influenced prominent figures in Albanian literature and culture. This paper focuses on the inspirations, similarities and differences between 'Last Mass in the Cathedral of St. Sophia' by the German author Stefan Zweig, who is one of the authors most frequently translated into Albanian, and 'The Church of St. Sofia' by the famous Albanian author, Ismail Kadare. The paper provides solid arguments demonstrating the interesting parallels between the theme, plot and motives in the two stories that depict the same historical event, the conquest of Constantinople and the invasion of Ottoman soldiers into the capital of the Byzantine Empire. Particularly, they emphasise the Church of Saint Sophia, the Sultan's amazement at its beauty, the conversion of the Church into a mosque and the covering of the Christian elements, the faces of the saints and especially 'those of Christ and Saint Mary'. Furthermore, icons and elements of historical and religious Christian significance, the fall of the Cross and the altering of the direction of prayers according to religious affiliation are also depicted. Thus, it may be said that great writers, such as Zweig and Kadare, do not have any regularity in where and when they appear. Hence, the connections and literary similarities, whether accidental or a sign of inspiration and influence, can be found in their works, as in many other authors of world literature.

Index Terms—Zweig, Kadare, comparative literature, translation, Albanian literature

I. INTRODUCTION

Linguistic and literary ties between German and Albanian cultures have a long and strong tradition. Even though the linguistic connection dates back earlier than literary ties, the latter, in recent decades, have recorded extraordinary progress, especially in the translation and spread of the literary works of many outstanding German authors. The works of Stefan Zweig, for instance, have been translated into Albanian by several prominent Albanian translators and authors. The increase in the number of translations of his work and their popularity grew to such an extent that Zweig is regarded as the foreign author most frequently translated into Albanian.

This literary environment of widespread translations of foreign works provides an opportunity for all researchers and comparatists to explore the reception, influence and echo of the works translated into Albanian. The extensive publications in foreign languages are evidence of foreign presence, positive reception and echo in Albanian literature and culture, influencing Albanian literary minds such as Ismail Kadare. To contribute to this literature, the current paper studies and analyses the stories of Stefan Zweig and those of the Albanian author Ismail Kadare, highlighting the similarities, affinities and differences between the two authors through the use of the comparative method.

In a narrow sense of the word, influence can be defined as a kind of mechanism in which one work creates another. According to T. S. Eliot, a writer can be inspired by another writer when impressed by his work (Mrasori, 2008, p. 230). This influence can appear as a feeling of similarity, curiosity or admiration towards this writer.

In all likelihood, there are different ways, types and levels of influence, ranging from conscious imitation to the unconscious influence of verses read and re-read. It could appear as imitations of the plot, characters or even the form of a literary work (Pichois et al., 1967, p. 76).

Usually, influences are a result of translations or adaptations, but sometimes reading a favourite work in its original language also has an impact. Occasionally, these influences can also act as a catalyst because they cause or accelerate the birth of a literary phenomenon. According to comparative literature researchers (Pichois et al., 1967, p. 76), the systematic study of influences and sources would perhaps give us the opportunity to reconsider and modify our view on certain literary issues. The fate and success of a work can be both national and international. Usually, the success of a work in national literature often extend to literatures of other nations, but we must first see what echo it produces in its

^{*} Corresponding author: naim.kryeziu@uni-pr.edu

own country before we expect its influence in other countries (Pichois et al., 1967, pp. 77–78).

II. ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

The fate of a work outside the country's border can be compared 'with waves in the form of concentric circles' (Mrasori, 2008, p. 231). However, there are cases, such as with Zweig, when a writer has more readers abroad than in his own country. Thus, some authors believe that accidental and intentional influences serve as inspiration and encouragement for further creativity or even imitation. Comparative literature scholars believe that tracking influences is not only permissible but also useful. Thus, important studies such as 'Zweig in Albanian', 'Zweig in France', 'Kadare in France', 'Kadare in Germany', etc. deal with the impact of the entire ocuvre, for example, of a German author in France, or of a foreign author in Germany or England (Mrasori, 2008, p. 231). However, sometimes the influence of a literary work or genre on one or several literatures can be studied. According to comparative literature researchers, Pichois and Rousseau, no literature would have the level of sophistication it has if it did not have contacts, connections and influences from other literatures (Pichois et al., 1967, pp. 77-78).

Any comparative literature study devoted to the general influence of a writer, a work, a literary genre or an entire body of literature on a foreign plane must, in the first place, take into account the question of fate or the dissemination of the work translated into the respective language. Since the original work can only be read by a certain group of people, a book, in most cases, gains through translation.

In such circumstances, a work can succeed as a translation when it receives kindness, interest and respect not only from expert critics but also from the public with literary taste and the general mass of readers. The success of a translated work can be determined by its reprints in the new environment. Similarly, the success of a translated drama can be observed by the number of performances, while that of translated fiction or poetry can be observed by the number of articles, reviews and reader impressions, as well as opinions of researchers. Sometimes, a translated work can also encounter negative reactions or cause controversy in the new environment. However, it must be said that the translated literary work often directly or indirectly influence creativity or trigger imitations, borrowings and experiments in literary creators of the translated language. Moreover, it can also be a source of successful inspiration.

Additionally, there are cases when even a modest or limited success of a literary work can result in small borrowings of expressions, phrases, thoughts, aphorisms, situations, scenes and ideas. In most cases, the influence can be observed in literary genres, artistic structure, subject, style, character and plot. Further, they can be borrowings of the subject, motive, thought and feeling. There are also cases when the translated work becomes a model for the new writer.

Comparative studies deal with the spectrum of questions about the close connections and dependence, as well as the inspirations, effects, influences, echo, reception and internal and external contacts, between different literatures (Corbineau-Hoffmann, 2013, p. 113). As for the influence of Zweig's works on Albanian literature, existing studies provide ample evidence that Zweig, in addition to his great presence through translations, reviews, articles and works about his work in Albanian, is also encountered through certain similarities, inspirations and influences observable on Albanian authors (Mrasori, 2008, pp. 35-47).

In this paper, we make a modest attempt to investigate some forms of accidental similarity, influence, imitation and inspiration of Zweig in the literary creations of the excellent Albanian writer Ismail Kadare. His works have been translated into more than 40 other languages, and hence, he can be compared and weighed against the most translated authors of world literature. In this study, we compare Zweig's 'Conquest of Constantinople – Last Mass in Saint Sophia Church' with Kadare's 'Saint Sophia's Church' from the 1999 collection *Theft of Royal Sleep* and the work *Sternstunden der Menschheit* (Stellar Moments of Humankind), also known by 'Orët yje të njerëzimit', as translated into Albanian by Jorgji Doksani.

Kadarean and Zweigian symbols often depict significant objects of human history such as The Castle, The Pyramids and The Great Wall of China, as well as historical places and events. Kadare in his Church of Saint Sophia and other works preferred the Ottoman Empire as the archetype of totalitarian social systems (Ku uku, 2008, p. 35). In an interview with A. Bosquet, Kadare emphasises that the Ottoman Empire is a gold mine for writers: 'In it, one finds all human races, religions, climates, landscapes and all the dramas of the peoples, especially all the mechanisms of totalitarian oppression, from the Roman Empire to Byzantium and the Mongols to the Third Reich and the Soviet Empire' (Kadare, 1996, p. 74).

On pages 82–100 of Kadare's 'The Church of St. Sophia' – which is part of the *Theft of the Royal Sleep* anthology published by the Onufri Publishing House in 1999 – we can find random similarities, or probably inspirations from Zweig's 'Conquest of Constantinople', in the 'Last Mass in the Cathedral of St. Sophia' section in pages 34–47 of *Stellar Moments of Humankind*, translated by Jorgji Doksani and published by Bota Shqiptare Publishing House in 2003.

Zweig's first historical miniature, 'The Conquest of Constantinople', is centred around the ambition, desire and ardent dream of Sultan Mehmet II to conquer the capital of the Byzantine Empire. Particularly, the siege, preparation for the attack, strategy techniques and sudden invasion of Constantinople and the Church of Saint Sophia are elaborately described.

Of all the chapters of the Zweigean miniature, only the last chapter entitled 'The Fall of the Down' seems to have resonated with Kadare since he turned it into an inspiration for his 'The Church of St. Sophia'. However, it could also be completely random and may have nothing to do with any resonance, prompt or inspiration. However, it is inevitable

not to notice some similarities between the two works in themes and fables. Even though both the stories describe the same historical event, a comparison between them reveals many differences as well. However, we will not focus on the differences in this study.

While Zweig in his miniature deals with a well-known historical subject, intertwined with his creative fantasy, he realises a captivating and powerful narrative with chronological and descriptive details. Kadare also presents a similar theme but with the help of an architect character named Kaur, who has been assigned to turn the Church of Saint Sophia into a mosque. Thus, we have a change in subject and style. Meanwhile, one may note that certain specific motives appear in both works. Among them stands out, for example, the motif of the invading soldiers of the Sultan, who had given them his word that they would be allowed complete freedom to rob, loot or do whatever they wanted during the three days in the occupied capital. Both Zweig and Kadare emphasise that 'for three days, according to tradition, not an hour more, the soldiers are free and can do whatever they want in the occupied city'. Below are some excerpts from the works of these two well-known authors of world literature.

For example, in Zweig, we read:

Sultan Mehmeti rode arrogantly on the horse of a pure Arab race, he looked stern and serious, without batting an eyelash he rode near the houses where merciless robbery was ravaging, he did not even want to turn his head to see what was happening, everything was as planned, he knew it would happen like that when he gave his word to the soldiers that they would have complete freedom to do whatever they wanted during three days in the occupied capital. Let the doomsday happen, he would keep his word! (Zweig, 2003, p. 45)

In Kadare, we read:

Another forty-two hours, architect Kaur said to himself. He was lying on the hard bed, neither asleep nor awake. Some scenes, by which a dream could easily be built, and just as easily destroyed, stood out in his eyes. He tried to guess which buildings had been knocked down, meanwhile, and what would still be destroyed in the forty-two hours that remained to the soldiers from the three-day period during which they would have the city at their mercy. They had waited more, like them, like the commanders, if not a week, at least five days, but the order had come straight from the Sultan's palace: three days, according to tradition, not an hour more. Outside the hooves of a horse that stopped with difficulty were heard, then the sound of a man falling to the ground, and finally his voice (Kadare, 1999, pp. 83–84).

The architect couldn't believe his ears. The Sultan told him that he had just given orders to stop the looting and orgies of the soldiers, although it was still the middle of the three-day period, that the Turks were not like the Greeks, who suffocated and flattened the conquered cities, that he would make Constantinople the capital of his empire and that Saint Sophia, which they said was the centre of the world, would not only not be destroyed, but he would made it even more beautiful (Kadare, 1999, p. 88).

Architect Kaur also makes an appearance in Kadare's other works, such as 'The Castle'. In this work as well Architect Kaur designates the points where the castle should be hit with cannons and how and where it should be attacked. Kaur in the 'Church of St. Sophia' has the role of turning the Church into a mosque and making it more beautiful (Çaushi, 1995, p.156). Kadare presents his architect as a hermaphrodite, neither male nor female, exactly as the work he must perform – neither a church nor a mosque, but something in between (Caushi, 1995, p. 156).

Zweig describes the Sultan's entry into the Church of Saint Sophia in the following way:

Sultan Mehmet, at the head of his spear, who did not walk, but rather flew, passed by the harried men, all dressed in silk, adorned as for a festival, with snow-white turbans on their heads, boasting and proud, as all-powerful victors, entering the main gate of slumbering Constantinople in the latter half of the day, when the fighting had ended, and the preying and plundering were at their peak (Zweig, 2003, pp. 44–45).

Sultan Mehmeti had told them he needed glory and his triumphal entry, this was his goal, the perpetuation of glory. It is true that the victory was complete, all-round, the devastation was dizzying, but he made this triumphal entry with a clearly defined goal: to set foot on the holy place of Christians, to enter proudly in the famous cathedral of Saint Sophia, in this symbol of glory and greatness of Byzantium (Zweig, 2003, p. 45).

Similarly, Kadare described the Sultan's entry in the following way:

The head of the line had meanwhile reached the entrance. People got up on their horses' saddles to see what was happening at the gate. The words "they are entering, they are entering" were heard. The viziers were getting off their horses, some of them turning their heads back, as if they were about to run away. The church gate was slowly swallowing everything. "Forgive me, God," said the architect as he crossed the threshold (Kadare, 1996, p. 85).

The description of the outside perspective – the 'horses clothed in silk' leading to the triumphal gates and 'the people who rose on their saddles' to observe 'how the church gate was swallowing everything' – are elements related to an internal perspective. The first one portrays the immortality of the glory, honour and pride of the Sultan and the regret that the architect feels.

The motif of the Sultan's amazement at the beauty of the Church of St. Sophia and his decision not to demolish the church but to convert it into a mosque has been encountered in both authors. In Zweig, it is expressed as follows:

From a hilltop not far from the walls of Constantinople, for more than fifty days, he had seen the domes and the magnificent belfry of St. Sophia, shining as unapproachable, and now, victorious as he was, he would

trample the holy place where the shrine stood, towering over the threshold of the bronze gate, gracefully carved (Zweig, 2003, p. 45).

... but even this time the proud Sultan found the strength of will to restrain himself: he called it a day to thank Allah, who gave him this great fortune, before crossing the threshold of the cathedral. The Sultan dismounted his white horse, bowed down to the ground to Allah with the words of prayer in his mouth, and after that he declared that he offered the cathedral of St. Sophia to the great Allah (Zweig, 2003, pp. 45–46).

He raised his eyes and saw in amazement, over-excited, the human miracle, he raised his eyes to the high domes shining sweetly from the setting sun, then he slowly lowered his gaze to the elegant arches that moved gently in the dim twilight, he caressed with piercing eyes the walls with jewel stone mosaics, which were sparkling. Captivated by the incomparable beauty, Sultan Mehmet said to himself that not to him, but to the majestic God, that cult miracle should belong from now on (Zweig, 2003, p. 46).

Meanwhile, in Kadare, this motif is elaborated in the form of a dialogue between the Sultan and the architect:

"I have chosen you for this," said the sultan. Why, Kaur wanted to ask. - Why did you choose me, my Lord? - As I said, I will neither demolish nor burn St. Sophia, - continued the Sultan. - As I said, I will make it more beautiful. - No. - It was too late for him not to swallow it again. It had come out in the meantime and everyone turned their heads all over, as if the short word was circling around like a wounded bird. - Saint Sophia won't get any more beautiful, Your Majesty, - said the architect. The Sultan chuckled. He was the only one who called him Majesty and Lord, in the manner of a Kaur. But he liked that. It will happen, Kaur, he said. I will turn Saint Sophia from a church into a mosque (Kadare, 1999, p. 88).

I have chosen you for this, because you are the best and ... most suitable," said the Sultan. - You are the only one who is in the middle ... neither Christian nor Muslim ... I even heard that you are a middle man ... neither man nor woman ... The architect turned whiter than lime. The Emperor's eyes were fixed again on the center of the other's body. "Hermaphrodites are considered sacred by us," he continued, in the same tired voice. That's why I entrust the center of the world to you. These were the final words, after which he did not wait for an answer. He turned his arms and went out followed by the guards (Kadare, 1999, p. 89).

In addition to the treatment devoted to the Church, the Sultan's boasting of religious affiliation and the form of prayer and thanksgiving they offered to God was a clear sign that he simultaneously wanted to grant his God this amazing temple that until yesterday belonged to the God of another faith. On the other hand, in Kadare, the religious aspect is reflected in the conversion of a church to a mosque, as well as Kaur's behaviour towards the Sultan. He addresses Sultan as Lord and Majesty, which is reflective of his Christian formation.

The beginning of the conversion of the church into a mosque, which in Zweig is small and not so dynamic, in Kadare sets the fable in motion. In Zweig, this motif is given to us as follows:

The next day, the craftsmen, by order of the Sultan himself, removed from the church all the signs of the former religion: taking away the altar, painted in whitewash the wonderful frescoes with images of saints, removed all the icons and everything else used in the rituals of Christians, uprooted the mosaic and sculptural works, toppled to the ground the high cross, which stood proudly above the Cathedral of St. Sophia and for thousands of years had kept the Savior's arms open, with which he conquered the whole world (Zweig, 2003, p. 46).

In Kadare, this motif appears more often and in the following way:

The colors with which the faces of Christ and Saint Mary were to be covered were there, in large vats, already prepared, waiting. But he was in no hurry. He had started the conversion with four phrases of the Koran, which were being drawn in four corners facing each other. He had also found the place where the minaret would be raised. The Sultan's prayer platform too. It was more difficult to emphasize the direction of Mecca and fading that of Jerusalem, which was noticeable from the first glance (Kadare, 1999, p. 93).

Now Christ and Saint Mary looked like behind a glass window. Meanwhile, the spies had managed to take letters to the Sultan. Whenever he was called to appear, he knew what would happen. The cries Kaur, traitor, infidel, he heard disdainfully, as if uttered in front of a corpse. The only difference was that he was on his feet. When his turn to explain came, he spoke briefly and clearly. The way he was covering the view that needed to be covered was the only one. Otherwise, Christian spirituality, completely suppressed behind the lime, would be more powerful. It was there, he felt it inside every stone, even deeper. It should not have been rudely strangled, by no means. Just like that, half-free, as he left her, she would naturally weaken (Kadare, 1999, p. 94).

As always, he walked a piece across the church. Some of the pillars were also of two religions. The left side of the peak as well. Thirteen of the forty windows were swaying. The church retreated slowly. It looked like he was giving up, but right in the middle of the back, he suddenly leaned forward. He used to do the same. He put up with the whims, he couldn't even think of it as anything other than that: whimsical. Sometimes he indulged in predictions about her future. What was he to do with this new spirit that was entering him: would it suddenly age him, rejuvenate him, or make him immortal? The majority, as expected, had understood this shift as a departure from Islam. A smaller part, on the contrary, as a Christian resistance. But a few had caught a new word in it: overcoming the impossible. They were horrified by this revelation (Kadare, 1999, p. 95).

The historical event includes covering the elements of historical and religious Christian importance. It is followed by the fall of the Cross and the changing of the direction of prayers – from Jerusalem to Mecca. The Ottoman invasion changed the appearance and broke the pride of thousands of years. Unlike Kadare, Zweig was much more descriptive and detailed in all other parts of the story, except here in the motif of converting the church into a mosque. Kadare is more chronological and descriptive of the event. He carefully reflected the feelings of the Sultan, who saw this action as a religious victory.

Finally, the motif of the Imam's appearance should be emphasised. In Zweig, it appears as a random motif, while in Kadare, it is more elaborate. In Zweig, the reason for the appearance of the Imam is given as follows:

He sent for the Imam, and told him to get on the chair and declare the shrine a symbol of the Mohammedan faith, while the Emperor, with his face turned towards Mecca, again offered prayers to Allah, the Almighty in the life of lives: it was the first time that such a prayer, of another religion, was heard within the walls of the Christian cathedral (Zweig, 2003, p. 46).

And in Kadare, it is explained as follows:

The first Islamic prayer was held on Friday. The Sultan sat alone in his seat. The others took their seats in a row on the revolving stage. The imam read the Koran with a drawn sword, which meant that the temple won with blood would be defended with blood. The Sultan never raised his head from the summit, so as not to give any sign that he was thinking of the collapse. The call of Allah is great, coming from hundreds of lungs, echoed a few times until it fell cold all over. After the prayer, the Sultan remained last, with a part of the viziers and the guard (Kadare, 1999, p. 96).

Both authors describe this motif as preserving and reflecting the Muhammadan religious tradition, with the prayers already directed to Allah and the holy place of Christians declared as a symbol of the Islamic faith.

III. CONCLUSION

The stories of the world-renowned authors Stefan Zweig and Ismail Kadare depict in their own ways a great historical event. When read carefully, apart from the differences in style and subject, both authors in some cases use data from the same historical sources and hence are sometimes quite similar. This is evident in the chronological description of the conquest of Constantinople, the capital of the Byzantine Empire and the taking control of the Church of Saint Sophia, with the aim to not destroy it but to turn it into a mosque. An event of such a great historical impact, it seems, did not escape from falling into the eyes, ears and hands of these two great writers.

In this study, through a comparative perspective, we have observed that the legacy, fate, echo and popularity of Zweig and his works in Albanian have left their mark on prominent Albanian authors such as Kadare. As a result, we have managed to analyse and compare, in addition to the theme and plot of these stories, many motives within them. Throughout the chronological development of the event, we have tried to compare parts with concrete examples, commenting in detail on the many motifs that built the fable or parts of it. We have dealt with the conquest of Constantinople, the invasion of Ottoman soldiers into the capital of the Byzantine Empire and the robberies and looting. Furthermore, the Sultan's amazement with the Church of Saint Sophia's beauty, the conversion of the church into a mosque and the Imam's prayers after the conversion have also been discussed. Through the translation of his work into Albanian, Zweig has brought a new thematic spirit with a cosmopolitan approach. This resulted in a new detailed way and style of writing and external models in literary creativity, which is further proof of the presence and impact of his works in this corner of Europe. Additionally, his work seems to have influenced the emancipation, modernisation and Western orientation of authors, readers and especially the literary school. Hence, the translation can also give rise to new models when transferred from one literature to another (Zemanek & Nebrig, 2012, p. 117).

Influences and literary similarities, whether accidental or not, stimulate discussions and debates of the most different kinds. They could be about themes, styles, languages, origins, imitations, influences, effects, borrowings and transfers from one language or culture to another.

Comparative literature is a methodical approach that uses connections of analogy, closeness and influence to extend literature to other fields of expression or knowledge. It approaches all data and literary texts, which may be distant in time and space but close enough to belong to many languages or cultures and be part of the same tradition. Comparative literature offers a superior description of these texts to understand and appreciate them better (Chevrel, 2002, pp. 26-27). In other words, it is a random meeting with the foreign, with one who does not speak the same language and does not have the same culture. Additionally, comparative literature also emphasises the importance of translation, spreading and radiating the impact of a work or national literature, enabling it to cross national borders and become part of world literature.

REFERENCES

- [1] Çaushi, T. (1995). Kadare, I. Fjalor i personazheve [Dictionary of Characters], Sh. B. E. Tiran ë
- [2] Chevrel, Y. (2002). Let ërsia e krahasuar [Comparative Literature], Albin, Tiran ë
- [3] Corbineau-Hoffmann, A. (2013). Einführung in die Komparatistik, ESV, Berlin.
- [4] Kadare, I. (1999). Vjedhja e gjumit mbret ëror [Stealing the royal sleep], Onufri, Tiran ë
- [5] Kadare. I. (1996). Dialog me A. Bosquet [Dialogue with A. Bosquet], Onufri, Tiran ë

- [6] Ku çuku, B. (2000). Kadare n ë gjuh ët e bot ës [Kadare in other Languages], Onufri, Tiran ë
- [7] Mrasori, N. (2008). Kur Cvajgu na flet shqip... [When Zweig speak to us in Albanian...] Rozafa, Prishtin ë
- [8] Pichois, C.L., & Rousseau, A. M. (1967). "La Literature Comparée", Paris, translated in the Croatian language.
- [9] Stefan Cvajg (Zweig), (2003). *Or ä yje t ë njer ëzimit: miniature historike* [Star hours of humanity: historical miniatures], Bota Shqiptare, Tiran ë.
- [10] Zemanek, E., & Nebrig, A. (2012). Kompraratistik, Akademie Verlag, Berlin.



Naser Mrasori is an Associate Professor within the Faculty of Philology at the University of Pristina, Kosovo. He teachesModern German Literature, Analysis of Literary Texts and Comparative Literature. Naser Mrasori has a number of publications in journals concerning the Analysis of Literary Text and Comparative Literature. Naser Mrasori is also a professor of German Department and an expert in Higher Education in Kosovo. (ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8286-8975)



Naim Kryeziu is an Assistant Professor within the Faculty of Philology at the University of Pristina, Kosovo. He is assigned for the subject of Literary Translation. Naim Kryeziu has a number of publications in different journals, mainly on Translation. He has published a number of books in respective fields of Literary Translation. Naim Kryeziu is also a well-known literary translator in Kosovo and Switzerland. (ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1501-6617)