

Meaning-Making in the Untranslatability: A Translanguaging Analysis of the Film *Love After Love*

Lili Han

Faculty of Languages and Translation, Macao Polytechnic University, Macao, China

Abstract—Films have been held for a long-term tradition as a meaning-making practice in visual and audio play, in the hybridization of language, image and sound, as well as in interactive symphonization with the audience/viewers. Through the emerging theoretical lens of translanguaging, this article analyzes the translingual practices, performance, instances in a Chinese film entitled *Love After Love* (adapted from Eileen Chang's short story and directed by the Hong Kong Director Anne Hui), in which a Portuguese sonnet lyrical poem (*Rimas*) is delicately crafted in the film and projected in the trailer. Through this analysis, we aim to examine how translanguaging aesthetics transcend language boundaries, transforming from the seeming untranslatability to communicative meaning-making practice. The film presents a situated and embodied poem recital scene that encompasses untranslatable moments of imagination, thus transcending the Mandarin-English-Portuguese divide. The encounter and intertwining of heterogeneous languages and registers create a transformative space replete with tensions between reality and imagination, between lucidity and ambiguity, between resistance and compliance, interrogating the underlying discourses beyond languages and rendering the untranslatability meaningful. This translanguaging-informed film review thus offers an insightful autopsy of the literary aesthetics of the novel by Eileen Chang.

Index Terms—translanguaging, AVTs in the film, meaning-making, untranslatability, Eileen Chang

I. INTRODUCTION

Films have been held for a long-term tradition as the process of meaning-making in visual and audio play, embedded in the hybridization of language, image and sound, as well as in interactive symphonization with the audience (Prince, 2014; Corrigan & White, 2012; Martinelli, 2020). This meaning-making practice takes place as a dynamic process of negotiation between the filmmakers and the audience/viewers, during which the filmmakers create images, sounds and languages, while the viewers make sense of the images and stories on the screen. In the go-betweenness and beyond of the audiovisually constructed multisemiotic and multimodal systems, structures and practices, a translanguaging-informed space (Li, 2011a, 2011b, 2018) is created, where viewers as embodied agents embrace the ongoing interactive moments of tensions and negotiations in relation to language, image and sound of audio-visual texts (AVTs). As sound, image and language are essential construal means of a film, we shall first define these three concepts following the audiovisual theoretical approach (Martinelli, 2020, p. IX). Specifically, a sound represents both the sound design and the soundtrack; image, indicates a particular focus on the significance of colors, and on-camera shots, angles, and movements; while language, manifests in either the spoken or written form (rhetoric and dialogues in various AVTs). These definitions help to contextualize the present study and enrich our understanding in relation to the meaning-making practice in audiovisuality.

The present article sets out to analyze the translanguaging space and moments in the film, with illustrations from the specific case study of a Chinese film entitled *Love After Love* (adapted from Eileen Chang's short story and directed by the Hong Kong Director Anne Hui). We will focus on its translingual, transemiotic and transmodal practices, performance, instances as embedded in the interplay of sound, image and language. In the film (cast in Mandarin), a Portuguese sonnet lyrical poem (*Rimas*) is deliberately and delicately crafted and projected in a recital, thus breaking a language boundary and generating an exotic aesthetic atmosphere. Chinese and English subtitles are provided as translingual practices throughout the whole film, including the translation of the Portuguese sonnet lyrical poem. The lens of translanguaging (Li, 2018) allows it to mobilize all available sensory repertoires of the audience/viewers in meaning negotiation, transcending linguistic boundaries and transforming from the seeming untranslatability to meaning-making communication, instead of being lost in translation. Thus, a translanguaging space between the film and the audience/viewers is dynamically constructed, nurtured, bounded and woven by audiovisual means intermingling sound, image and language. Based on these translanguaging instances, situated in specific time and space, the present article aims at teasing out the following aspects of some intricate relations between: 1) translanguaging and meaning-making in the film; 2) sound, image and language (AVTs) versus untranslatability; 3) translanguaging instances in *Love After Love*.

By analyzing the situated and embodied poem recital scene in *Love After Love*, we will focus on the untranslatability of the translanguaging instances that encompass the audiovisual means (sound, image, and language): the sound and image

dimensions of language are explored to enrich understandings in audiovisuality, transcend the linguistic boundaries and beyond, and make sense of images and stories on the screen. The encounter and intertwining of heterogeneous languages, sound and image create a transformative space replete with tensions between reality and imagination, between lucidity and ambiguity, between resistance and compliance, interrogating the underlying discourses beyond languages and making the untranslatability meaningful.

II. TRANSLANGUAGING AND MEANING-MAKING IN THE FILM

Both translanguaging and meaning-making share their communicative purposes in common in the film. On the one hand, translanguaging, as a practical theory of language and human communication, empowers multilingual, multimodal and multisemiotic communication, achieving meaning-making by transcending and breaking the artificial and ideological divides (Li, 2011a, 2011b, 2018). Etymologically, translanguaging has its suffix (trans- and -ing) well explained. “Trans-” in translanguaging means beyond the boundaries, transcending disciplinary boundaries and linguistic boundaries, deterritorializing the delimitations between human cognition and communication, while “-ing” in translanguaging refers the dynamic meaning-making process during which multilingual users employ multisensory, multimodal and multisemiotic resources (Garcia & Li, 2014; Zhu & Li, 2016; Zhu & Li, 2020).

As a multimodal artifact and a medium for meaning-making, the film itself is the assemblage of multiple modes or modalities (sound, image and language) that presents sense-making stories to its audience/viewers (Martinelli, 2020). Meaning-making or sense-making in the film, in turn, is one of the golden rules of audiovisual communication in face of the complexity of reality. In the dynamic interplay of sound, image and language, the meaning/sense of the film is conveyed, communicated, perceived and deciphered by its audience/viewers. This communication requires a translanguaging ability (Li, 2018), as represented by “multiliteracy” (p. 22), which is instrumental to understand and appreciate the multimodality of the film:

Multiliteracy, the ability to comprehend and analyze different modes in communication—not only to read text, but also to read other modes such as sound and image, and more importantly to understand how the different modes are put together to create meaning—is a crucial component for the social semiotic perspective on multimodality (Li, 2018, p. 22).

As such, it can be argued that translanguaging is the methodological apparatus through which the audience or viewers employ to understand the meaning of the film in that it empowers the communicative ability by resorting to multiliteracy in comprehension and analysis of the audiovisual means (sound, image and language) of films. In addition, the translanguaging methodology is further validated by embracing the multimodal social semiotic view:

As it has been developed as a theoretical concept, Translanguaging embraces the multimodal social semiotic view that linguistic signs are part of a wider repertoire of modal resources that sign makers have at their disposal and that carry particular socio-historical and political associations. It foregrounds the different ways language users employ, create, and interpret different kinds of signs to communicate across contexts and participants and perform their different subjectivities. In particular, Translanguaging highlights the ways in which language users make use of the tensions and conflicts among different signs, because of the socio-historical associations the signs carry with them, in a cycle of resemiotization. (Li, 2018, p. 22)

Through the lens of translanguaging, language is only part of our modal resources and language users’ repertoire has an extending reach to absorb multimodal and multisemiotic signs at their proposal. This translanguaging perspective broadens and enriches the conceptualization scope of language and paves for language users a wider way of possibilities in dealing with conflicts and tensions in the film. In the same sense, audience/viewers in film scenarios, as language users, are empowered by the translanguaging apparatus to mobilize visual, audio, linguistic and sensory repertoires, as well as employ the available surrounding affordances to make senses of the AVTs.

III. SOUND, IMAGE AND LANGUAGE (AVTs) VERSUS UNTRANSLATABILITY

Sound, image, and language are three construal means of audiovisual texts (AVTs) in films. In the audiovisual context, a text is understood as “any item of any size and length that conveys meaning” (Martinelli, 2020, p. IX). Films/movies are considered texts that are produced and interpreted as a particular medium of communication. Numerous AVTs composed of sound, image and language constitute films/movies.

In audiovisuality, a sound refers to “everything we hear in an AVT, including of course spoken language” (Martinelli, 2020, p.164), concretely represented by the sound design and the soundtrack; an image, the visual aspect of the AVT, comes with a particular focus on the significance of colors, and on-camera shots, angles, and movements; while the language, in both spoken and written forms, is the primary communicative AVT (Martinelli, 2020, p. 208). In audiovisuality, the intricate relationship of the three means (sound, image and language) are portrayed by Martinelli (2020) in a Venn diagram, which shows the logical and interactive relations among the three-audiovisual means. In this diagram, language is situated in the middle, as it has both sonic (spoken language) and visual (written language) dimensions. This intersection envisages that language in the film scenario is audio-visually enriched and empowered by the sound and image dimensions. At the same time, all the language qualities are audio-visually represented by the sound and image dimensions. Language, situated right at the intersection in-between the sound and the image, shows its great vitality in

mobilizing the other two dimensions. This diagram grounds the methodological approach of translanguaging in audiovisuality, corroborating the idea that language is part of modal resources and language users' repertoire has an extending reach to multimodal and multisemiotic signs at their proposal. In this sense, the sound, the image and the language are all part and partial of the translanguaging apparatus in audiovisuality.

As translanguaging is an ongoing interactive process, the intersection of sound, image and language presents dynamic cooperative or competitive relations in their coexistence and interplay, which also reflects the innate nature of multimodality:

Multimodality is defined as a process of communication when different patterns coexist to display one or more texts. It operates in almost every communication context, except the most elementary ones. The interesting part is that this coexistence takes different shapes, which can be either cooperative or even competitive (Martinelli, 2020, p. 84).

This cooperation or competition of the three construal means of AVTs manifests the tension and meaning-negotiation in communication: the AVTs' messages might be understood or misunderstood by the audience/viewers in transmission and reception, while the understanding or misunderstanding depends on how the messages are interpreted, decoded, deciphered and translanguaged in communication. As language reflects "clarity and immediacy of a message" (Martinelli, 2020, p. 208) as a communicative AVT to deliver messages, the employment of language in AVTs conditions the understanding of audience/viewers in regards to the whole story on screen. As most films have multilingual AVTs by adding subtitling or dubbing to facilitate multilingual communication, one linguistic issue in relation to translatability and untranslatability constitutes an inevitable topic in audiovisual meaning-making. In the present study, instead of discussing the unconciliated binary dilemma of translatability and untranslatability, our focus goes to examine the dichotomy from an opposite point of view:

Untranslatability can be viewed as not a curse but a blessing – it reminds us that translation is always hard, but it lends translation a tragic nobility. It leads translation not to throw up their hands in despair; instead, it energizes and spurs them on to ever more resourceful creative responses (Large, 2018, p. 61).

In this positive binary relationship, untranslatability is not seen as a translanguing sin, but as bliss that embraces more resourceful and creative responses, which enables the audience/viewers to break the conceptual boundaries of translation, resorting to their multimodal and multisemiotic repertoire at their disposal, to get a situated, embedded, embodied and enacted translanguing experience. For example, poetry is seen above all translations, as it is claimed that poetry is defined as untranslatable (Jakobson, 1966). In the case of instances of AVTs being a recital of poetry verses, untranslatability is highlighted as a linguistic problem in communication. Nonetheless, as poetry "focused primarily on language and the relations between sound, meaning, and image, along the lines of concrete poetry" (Martinelli, 2020, p.52), the perspective of translanguaging is revealed in sense-making, since it values relational empowerment by sound and image, transcends the linguistic boundaries and embraces an atmospherical and aesthetical spur from untranslatability.

In the following paragraphs, by giving specific examples, we demonstrate how the sound, image, and language operate versus untranslatability of the AVTs through the lens of translanguaging.

IV. TRANSLANGUAGING-INFORMED AVTs INSTANCES IN *LOVE AFTER LOVE* (CHINESE: 第一炉香)

The film *Love after Love* (Chinese: 第一炉香) and its translanguing practices are analyzed as a case study for illustrating the audiovisual meaning-making and untranslatability phenomenon. By adopting translanguaging as an analytical perspective, we explore how the audiovisual construal of the film (its sound, image, and language) extends the semiotic and spatial repertoires to enable the audience/viewers to create a translanguaging space for translanguing meaning-making in the seeming untranslatability. Multimodal analysis with screen snapshots will be used to analyze the audiovisual data, augmented with the textual analysis of the original works. It is argued that the translanguaging aesthetics transcend language boundaries, fully exploiting the semiotic audiovisual resources for creating an ongoing interactive space in the film, thus transforming the seeming untranslatability into communicative meaning-making practice. Such a translanguaging space, in turn, allows the audience/viewers to co-construct a more engaging environment for film appreciation.

A. *Love After Love* (Chinese: 第一炉香)

The film *Love After Love* is a Chinese romance drama film directed by Anne Hui and it was released in 2020. The film had its world debut premiere at the 77th Venice International Film Festival on September 8, 2020. It was the third film that Hui directed an Eileen Chang adaptation (following the 1984 *Love in A Fallen City* and the 1997 *Eighteen Springs*). It was an adaption of Chang's short story *Crumbs of Ligumaloes - the First Incense Burnt* (2006). The film was produced with all dialogues spoken in Mandarin, with Chinese and English subtitles, except for one special episode where the translanguing practice is preserved on purpose – the Portuguese poem recital. In this episode, the Chinese-Portuguese miscegenation dandy QiaoQi cited an excerpt of a Portuguese sonnet lyrical poem to allure the female protagonist WeiLong, a university student from Shanghai. The episode is spoken in Portuguese, which is an interlude in the middle of conversations spoken in Mandarin, and it thus presents an audiovisual aesthetics beyond translation, despite its subtitles in both Chinese and English. From the feedback of both the protagonists and their conversations, the untranslatability gains its preponderance in pushing forward the plots, and meanwhile, achieving the expected aesthetic effects.

We shall now first perform an autopsy analysis of the poem. It is a popular love poem by Camões, arguably the greatest Portuguese poet known as the father of the nation, for his poem collection *Os Lusíadas*. As a sonnet¹, this poem "Love is a burning and invisible fire" (first stanza, *Amor é um fogo que arde sem se ver*) is based on the rhyme of the Italian sonnet ABBA, ABBA, CDC, DCD (A = *er*; B = *ente*; C = *ade*; D = *or*), as shown in the following:

Amor é um fogo que arde sem se ver; (A)
 爱是燃烧而看不见的火
 É ferida que dá, e não se sente; (B)
 是疼痛而感觉不到的伤
 É um contentamento descontente; (B)
 是不能满足的满足
 É dor que desatina sem doer. (A)
 是无痛而又痛彻心肺的痛楚
 É um não querer mais que bem querer; (A)
 爱是比较更深的不爱
 É solitário andar por entre a gente; (B)
 是茫茫人海里孤独的跋涉
 É um nunca contentar-se e contente; (B)
 是永远不会因满足而满足
 É um cuidar que ganha em se perder; (A)
 是失去时才得到的关照
 É um sentir-se preso por vontade; (C)
 爱是心甘情愿的被俘
 É servir a quem vence, o vencedor; (D)
 是胜者服从于败者
 É ter com quem nos mata lealdade; (C)
 是与谋害我们忠诚之人的相约
 Mas como causar pode seu favor; (D)
 如果爱是这般自相矛盾
 Nos mortais corações conformidade; (C)
 又如何能在人的内心深处
 Sendo a si tão contrário o mesmo Amor? (D)
 激起如此真挚的情感?

Compared to the short story of Chang's *Crumbs of Ligumaloes - the First Incense Burnt*, this sonnet poem is an add-on by the film director Anne Hui. In the original short story, this episode is presented in the following words:

Original text:

[薇龙]便拣了一张长椅坐下，乔琪也跟着坐下了。隔了一会儿，薇龙噗哧一笑道：“静默三分钟，倒像致哀似的。”乔琪道：“两个人一块儿坐着，非得说话不可？”一面说，一面把手臂伸了过来，搭在薇龙背后的椅靠上。薇龙忙道：“我们还是谈谈话的好。”乔琪道：“你一定要说话，我说葡萄牙话给你听。”当下低低的说了起来，薇龙侧着头，抱着膝盖，听了半晌，笑道：“我又不不懂你在说些什么。多半你在骂我呢！”乔琪柔声道：“你听我的口气是在骂你么？”薇龙突然红了脸，垂下头。乔琪道：“我要把它译成英文说给你听，只怕我没有这个胆量。”薇龙掩住耳朵道：“谁要听？”便立起身来向人丛中走去 (Chang, 2006, p. 275).

Our translation is based on the subtitles of the film:

WeiLong picked up a bench and sat down, QiaoQi also followed to sit down. After a while, WeiLong chuckled, "we sit silently for three minutes, as if we're in mourning." QiaoQi responded, "when two persons sit together, do they have to talk?" As he was saying, he stretched his arms over the chair where WeiLong was seated. WeiLong continued hurriedly: "it would be nicer if we did talk." QiaoQi replied: "If you insist, I will speak to you in Portuguese." Then he began to speak in a low voice. WeiLong tilted his head, hugged knees, listened for a while, then smiled, saying: "I don't understand, maybe you are cursing me!" QiaoQi replied in a gentle voice: "Did that sound like cursing?" Suddenly blushed, WeiLong lowered her head. QiaoQi continued: "I'll translate it into English for you, but I'm not brave enough." WeiLong, in her turn, covered her ears saying, "who wants to listen?", then stood up and walked towards the crowd.

In the part of the short story, the Portuguese language is entailed in the context: its foreignness and the dialogues it raises are the focus of this episode. As to its content, there is only one phrase: then he began to speak in a low voice. Eileen manipulates the words in her writing to achieve the literary aesthetics in communication with the readers:

¹ Sonnet, which literally means little poem, small ballad, is a type of stereotyped poem, composed of fourteen verses. It originated in Italy in the 13th century and then spread to European countries.

We have also an aesthetic function for communication, which occurs when the main focus is the message in itself, in its form and appearance, rather than its contents, which remain important but not so prominent as we would expect them to be. Aesthetic signs are usually employed with an idea of adding beauty, fascination, and also a bit of pleasant ambiguity to communication—and that is very common in all kinds of art (Martinelli, 2020, p. 86).

In addition, this literary aesthetics by Eileen's works manifests its audiovisual appeal, which is evident in the actions and reactions of the two protagonists. In Eileen's words, the two protagonists are arranged with different designs. QiaoQi is set in a soundscape by speaking "in a low voice" ("低低的") and replying "in a mild voice" ("柔声道"), hinting at something unseen, imaginative and ambiguous. On the other hand, WeiLong has vivid and concrete images, presented by a sequence of body actions. As QiaoQi speaks Portuguese, WeiLong tilts her head ("侧着头"), hugs her knees("抱着膝盖"), listens for a while ("听了半晌"), showing her interest and curiosity. Though the content is not deciphered, the atmosphere and the tone are alluring. After WeiLong gets the hinting to pursue messages, she gets blushed ("红了脸") and lowers her head ("垂下头"). Obviously, she reacts to hide her embarrassment by avoiding eye contact, followed by a series of resistance and refusal actions: covering ears ("掩住耳朵"), standing up ("立起身来") and walking away ("走去"). Though nothing of the Portuguese content is mentioned here, the messages conveyed by the sound and the image permeate our sensory boundaries and result in meaning-making. As such, the two dimensions of sound and image, in Eileen's words, weave a meaningful picture in the readers' mental space.

This literary aesthetics in communication is further reinforced in the film by Ann Hui. In the film, the original solo phrase is elaborated into a play of a recital of Portuguese sonnet poem, naturally embedded in the dialogues of the two protagonists, as part of the soundscape of the episode. As content is not designed as a priority in communicating its literary aesthetics, the Portuguese musicality and its sound dimension become salient in the moments of untranslatability: out of the temporal engagement in foreignness and the sonnet pattern's musicality, there is the outburst of underlying messages between reality and imagination, between lucidity and ambiguity and between resistance and compliance.

B. Sounds, Images, and Languages in Love After Love

The interplay of sounds, images, and languages is a dynamic ongoing process, replete with cooperation and competition. Sometimes music is weighing in a dominant position, as its effects have the special power of hinting at the unseen, whereas images can only show what are visible. In addition, the music extends an image's range of meaning by adding psychological or emotional qualities, not easy or possible to achieve in the pictures alone (Martinelli, 2020, p. 205). This affirmation has been suggested by recent scientific research:

Vision is believed to dominate our multisensory perception of the world. Here we overturn this established view by showing that auditory information can qualitatively alter the perception of an unambiguous visual stimulus to create a striking visual illusion. Our findings indicate that visual perception can be manipulated by other sensory modalities (Shams et al., 2000, p. 788).

As language has both sonic (spoken language) and visual (written language) dimensions, the cooperation and competition of sounds and music are also reflected in language. By using the recital of Sonnet lyrical poem, for example, the musicality of the sonnet pattern (ABBA, ABBA, CDC, DCD) attributes far more messages than the words occurring in the subtitling, with its timber, tone and alike adding affective qualities and hinting the unseen imaginative relationship and beyond, envisaging a soundscape replete with ambiguous atmosphere.

Images, in its turn, as a visual aspect of AVT, have a direct impact on audiovisuality, as affirmed by Martinelli (2020, p.178), "no matter how important and how relevant sounds (or language) may be, an AVT will always remain mostly an image's affair—also in terms of recognizability". With the image's particular focus on the significance of colors, and on-camera shots, angles, and movements, the audience/viewers are led to evaluate and identify the plots, decipher the emotions (fear, anger, happiness, sadness, surprise, and disgust) conveyed through gestures and facial expressions across cultures (Prince, 2014, p. 144). The image appeal in the instance of recital of Portuguese sonnet poem is accomplished by the camera angles and movements (gradual switch of long shots and closeups), the colors (red rose, black suits, yellow *cheongsam*, green shawl, etc.), the gestures (head-turning, hand-raising, eyes-lowering), the emotions (happiness, disappointment, etc.), contributing all to the meaning-making of the Portuguese sonnet lyrical poem.

The tensions among the sound, image, and language in meaning-negotiation are more dimensional and reinforced in the film by Anne Hui. In *Love After Love*, the Portuguese sonnet recital is added as a sound design to reinforce the aesthetic effects: its musicality and underlying messages of love in untranslatability leave space for imagination, ambiguity, and compliance, in contrast to the Chinese/English subtitled contents which point to the reality, lucid immediacy and resistance. The sound, image and language in this Portuguese sonnet recital episode exert transformative power in meaning-making. The following table presents the multimodal episodes of the Portuguese sonnet recital. In a total of 50 seconds, we divide it into 8 instances. For the image dimension, the focus is put on the camera position, the body movement, the gesture, and the facial expressions of the protagonists; for the sound dimension, emphasis is put on the background music and the spoken language; as to the language dimension, both spoken language (the sonic aspect) and written language (the visual aspect) are presented, as shown in Table 1.

TABLE 1
MULTIMODAL INSTANCES OF AVTS IN THE FILM *LOVE AFTER LOVE*
(00H38M30S - 00H39M20S, IN TIME SEQUENCES)

Image (position)	Sound/Spoken language	Written language
Long shot Both look down.	Light background music /Mandarin	QiaoQi: 我说些葡萄牙文话给你听 I'll speak to you in Portuguese
Long shot QiaoQi looks to the front; WeiLong looks at QiaoQi.	Light background music/Portuguese	QiaoQi: 爱情是看不见的火焰 Love is a fire which burns unseen
Long shot QiaoQi looks to the front; WeiLong looks at QiaoQi.	Light background music/Portuguese	QiaoQi: 爱情是不觉痛的创伤 An aching wound, which can't be healed
Long shot QiaoQi looks to the front; WeiLong looks at QiaoQi.	Light background music/Portuguese	QiaoQi: 爱情是不开心的快乐 Love is contentment that creates discontent.
Close up QiaoQi looks at WeiLong; WeiLong lowers eyes, looking to the front.	Light background music/Mandarin	WeiLong: 多半你是在骂我 Maybe you are cursing me.
Close up QiaoQi looks at WeiLong; WeiLong lowers eyes, looking to the front.	Light background music/Mandarin	QiaoQi: 我这听起来像在骂你吗? Did that sound like cursing?
Medium close up QiaoQi looks at WeiLong; WeiLong looks to the front.	Light background music/Mandarin	QiaoQi: 那我把它翻成英文给你听吧 I'll translate it into English for you.
Medium close up QiaoQi looks at WeiLong; WeiLong looks to the front.	Light background music/Mandarin	WeiLong: 谁要听 Who wants to hear it?

The multimodal instances present us with the relationships among the sound, image, and language employed in the film. The camera position (the image dimension) makes its change when the Portuguese poem recital starts and when it stops. At the moments of the recital, QiaoQi looks to the front, immersed in the poetic mood, sometimes with gestural movements, while WeiLong looks at him, focused. The long shots of the camera build up a broader situated atmosphere. Interestingly, as the poem recital stops, both protagonists change their positions: QiaoQi looks back to WeiLong, expecting some feedback, but WeiLong retreats, withdrawing her attention and looking elsewhere, to avoid eye contact with QiaoQi. The camera moves gradually to capture the closeup of WeiLong's quarter-front facial expressions. Obviously, this change is not a coincidence, but in symphonization of the inner activities of both protagonists. In addition, the use of the red rose (with a strong connotation of love) that QiaoQi put in the upper pocket and the yellow *cheongsam* (attention-grabbing color, associated with youth) that WeiLong wears are chromatic implications in message delivery. In this sense, the image has accomplished its function, while the function of subtitling is weakened as the image dimension of language. On the other hand, as to the sound dimension, the dialogue between two protagonists around the Portuguese poem is pushing forward the plots. The Portuguese poem recital gains dominance by its musicality and untranslatability, mobilizing the audience/viewer multimodal repertoire to capture the moments of ambiguity, imagination and compliance. The last two instances are also revealing in this sense:

QiaoQi: I will translate it into English for you.

WeiLong: Who wants to hear it?

WeiLong's refusal confirms once again the untranslatability of the poem. Once it is translated, all the ambiguous aesthetics dilutes. The translation is not necessary here, since the love message has been transmitted undeniably via all available audiovisual signs. Translanguaging makes meaning-making a possibility by transcending sound, image, and language, adding beauty, fascination, and pleasant ambiguity to communication.

V. CONCLUSION

In this article, we have proposed translanguaging as a methodological apparatus in film appreciation, by resorting to all the available audiovisual repertoires: the sound, the image, and the language. By analyzing the enriched dimensions of language in AVTs contexts, we have explored the sense-making in the untranslatability with a specific case study of the Chinese film entitled *Love After Love*. The lens of translanguaging allows us to mobilize all available sensory repertoires of the audience/viewers in meaning negotiation, thus transcending linguistic boundaries and transforming from the seeming untranslatability to meaning-making communication, instead of being lost in translation. The Portuguese sonnet poem, as the key object of analysis, is autopsied in the audiovisual dimensions through multimodal transcriptions,

augmented with the supporting textual analysis of the short story. The insidious love messages are naturally deciphered and unfolded in the interwoven audiovisual signs, whereas the poem's contents lost their weight in literary aesthetics.

In the translanguaging space co-constructed between the film and the audience/viewers, Eileen's literary aesthetics is dynamically constructed, nurtured, bounded, and woven by miscellaneous audiovisual means. The situated and embodied poem recital scene that encompasses untranslatable moments of imagination, transcends all the linguistic divides and creates a transformative space replete with tensions between the reality and imagination, between lucidity and ambiguity, between resistance and compliance, probing into the underlying discourses beyond languages and ultimately rendering the untranslatability meaningful. Above all, we believe that this translanguaging-informed film review thus offers us an insightful autopsy of the literary aesthetics of the novel by Eileen Chang and its adapted film.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author would like to acknowledge sincere thanks to Dr. Wen Zhisheng (Edward) for careful proofreading of the early drafts of the paper.

REFERENCES

- [1] Chang, Eileen. (2006). *Chen Xiang Xie: Di Yi Lu Xiang* [Crumbs of Ligumaloes - the First Incense Burnt]. In *Zhang Ailing Xuan Ji* [Collections of Eileen Chang] (pp. 247-304). Beijing: October Literature and Art Publishing House.
- [2] Corrigan, T., & White, P. (2012). *The film experience: An introduction*. Macmillan.
- [3] Jakobson, R. (1966). *On Linguistic Aspects of Translation*. In Reuben A. Brower (Ed.), *On Translation* (pp. 233-235). Galaxy.
- [4] Large, D. (2018). The untranslatable in philosophy. In K. Lateef-Jan & S. J. Levine (Eds.), *Untranslatability* (pp. 50-63). Routledge.
- [5] Li, W. (2011a). Multilinguality, Multimodality and Multicompetence: Code- and Mode-Switching by Minority Ethnic Children in Complementary Schools. *Modern Language Journal*, 95(3), 370-384.
- [6] Li, W. (2011b). Moment Analysis and Translanguaging Space: Discursive Construction of Identities by Multilingual Chinese Youth in Britain. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 43, 1222-1235.
- [7] Li, W. (2018). Translanguaging as a practical theory of language. *Applied Linguistics*, 39(1), 9-30.
- [8] Martinelli, D. (2020). *What you see is what you hear*. Springer International Publishing.
- [9] Prince, S. (2014). *Movies and meaning: an introduction to film* (6th ed.). Pearson Education Limited.
- [10] Shams, L., Kamitani, Y., & Shimojo, S. (2000). What you see is what you hear. *Nature*, 408(6814), 788-788.
- [11] Zhu, H. & Li, W. (2016). Transnational experience, aspiration and family language policy. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 37(7), 655-666.
- [12] Zhu, H. & Li, W. (2020). Translanguaging, identity, and migration. In J. Jackson (Ed.), *The Routledge Handbook of Language and Intercultural Communication* (pp. 234-248). Routledge.

Lili Han (Ph.D.) is Director/Dean and Associate Professor of the Faculty of Languages and Translation of Macao Polytechnic University, Macau. Over the last decade, Dr. Han has lectured and conducted research in interpreting studies, acting as trainer for the Conference Interpreting (Chinese-Portuguese-English) course in partnership with the DG (SCIC) of the European Commission. Her research interests include interpreting studies, intercultural studies, language and translation policy studies, interpreting testing & assessment, and computer-aided interpreting, all from a translanguaging perspective.