

Translating Intertextual Overtones: With Emphasis on English Translation of Classic Chinese Poems

Xiaohua Jiang

Faculty of Languages and Translation, Macao Polytechnic University, Macao SAR, China

Abstract—Intertextual overtone is a kind of additional implication engendered from intertexts when a reader's sentiment or imagination is triggered by an intertext-related text the reader is reading. Intertextuality is one of the most prominent literary features of Chinese classic poems. It greatly influences the implicational spectrum of the poems, bringing about extralinguistic overtones, which are often elusive or difficult to understand, let alone translating them. This paper analyzes different overtones stemming from intertexts appeared in Chinese classic poems, arguing that these overtones are, to a great extent, poetic "eyes" or poetic "souls" of the poems, and should be carefully handled in translation.

Index Terms—intertextuality, intertextual overtone, translation, Chinese classic poem

I. INTRODUCTION

Originally coming from literary criticism, "intertextuality" is used in many different academic fields. It "has been defined so variously that, as Irwin (2004) points out, it has acquired almost as many meanings as users" (Panagiotidou, 2011, p. 1). It is "one of the most commonly used and misused terms in contemporary critical vocabulary" (Allen, 2011, p. 1). It may be defined as "a precondition for the intelligibility of texts, involving the dependence of one text upon another" (Hatim & Mason, 1990, p. 241). To be more specific, intertextuality may be seen as an aspect through which we can recognize the interrelations or interactions between texts in a paradigm. Indeed, while reading classic Chinese poems, we are often aware of a host of associative meanings, which are related to our previous reading experiences. And some of the associative meanings come from intertexts. Intertexts are what intertextuality is based on. Intertextuality has been defined in different ways (cf. Kristeva, 1969; Barthes, 1970; Lemke, 1985; Sebeok & Denesi, 1988, etc.)

To sum up, the somewhat different definitions may be classified into three major categories:

- a) The poststructural or deconstructional view: every text is constructed as an intertextual mosaic of citations; every text is an intertextual absorption and transformation of other texts (Kristeva, 1969, p. 146; Barthes, 1970)
- b) Diachronical and paradigmatic view: intertextuality is seen as textual relationship between distinct texts (extratextuality), where cultural connotations and knowledge structures are incorporated into intertextual references (Barthes, 1970; Lemke, 1985).
- c) Synchronical and syntagmatic view: intertextuality is seen as textual relationship between elements within a text -- intratextuality (Hatim & Mason, 1990, pp. 122-3; Lemke, 1985).

It must be noted that Lemke (1985), and Sebeok and Denesi (1988) hold an integrative view, one that involves items b) and c), and Barthes has a view embodying a) and c) (Wang, 1995, p. 250). This paper is grounded on the diachronic and paradigmatic view. Generally speaking, the greater the intertextual intensity of a poem, the more its connotations or implications, and the more room for its unlimited semiosis. The host text, i.e. the text where the intertextual line or phrase is in, may be taken as a "prompter" (Nida, 1982, p. 56) of the pretexts or intertexts, and the pretexts or intertexts may be seen as the "semotaxis" (Nida, 1982, p. 58) of the host text.

As users of texts, translators usually recognize and take part in the interaction of not only one text with another, but also one signifying system with another, both within the same language and across languages (Nida, 1982, p. 58). The essential point of analyzing an intertextual reference is to reveal the thematic contribution it makes to its host text. In travelling from the source to the host text, the intertextual sign undergoes substantial modification of its code of signification (Nida, 1982, p. 58). No intertextual sign can be transferred into another language on the strength of its informational purport alone, because an intertextual sign normally outranks its information content and brings with it its entire discursive history including new sign values that it has gathered on the way. In what follows, we are to examine the transference of three important kinds of intertextual values, namely, implication accretion, sentimental halo and intersubjective validity. And the analyses of the following examples may offer us a new and interesting perspective to understand the overtones that might otherwise be overlooked.

II. DISCUSSIONS: OVERTONES ENGENDERED FROM INTERTEXTS

Intertextual overtone is a kind of additional implication engendered from intertexts when a reader's sentiment or imagination is triggered by an intertext-related text the reader is reading. It includes, but is not restricted to, a) implication accretion, b) sentimental halo, and c) intersubjective validity.

A. Implication Accretion

Implication accretion is an intertextual overtone that increases or enriches the original poetic connotations. Let's look at the following example:

- 1) 戶庭無塵雜，虛室有餘閑[Hù tíng wú chén zá, xū shì yǒuyú xián]。(陶潛《歸園田居·其一》)
 - a) There is no dust or clatter
In the courtyard before my house.
My private rooms are quiet,
And calm with the leisure of moonlight through an open door. (Tr. Amy Lowell)
 - b) Into my courtyard no one should intrude,
Nor rob my private rooms of peace and leisure. (Tr. Xu Yuanzhong)
 - c) At gate and courtyard -- no murmur of the world's dust;
In the empty rooms -- leisure and deep stillness. (Tr. A. Waley)
 - d) Around my door and courtyard, no dust or clutter,
In my empty rooms, leisure enough to spare. (Tr. Burton Watson)
 - e) No dust and confusion within my doors and courtyard,
In my empty rooms, more than sufficient leisure. (Tr. Cyril Birch)

Tao Qian's idyll "Return to Nature" (《歸園田居》) consists of five poems, where the term "虛室" (xū shì, literally "empty room") occurs twice: one is in the line quoted above, the other is in the following line:

- 2) 白日掩荆扉，虛室絕塵想。[Bái rì yǎn jīng fēi, xū shì jué chén xiǎng] (陶潛《歸園田居·其二》)

I shut my wattled gate in broad daylight,
And stay home without mundane chores in sight. (Tr. Wang Rongpei)

In terms of the immediate syntagmatic context, "虛室" in Tao's "Return to Nature" means "my private room" or "my tranquil empty room", for it is in respective contrast with "戶庭" (hù tíng, the courtyard) and "荆扉" (jīng fēi, the doors). However, in the light of the paradigmatic context, it is safe to say that Tao's "虛室" is in intertextual relationship with "虛室" in *Chuang Tzu* (《莊子》), a philosophical classic of Taoism:

- 3) 氣也者虛而待物者也。唯道集虛，虛者心齋也。……瞻彼闕者，虛室生白，吉祥止止。
[Qì yě zhě xū ér dài wù zhě yě. Wéi dào jí xū, xū zhě xīn zhāi yě. …… Zhān bǐ què zhě, xū shìshēng bái, jíxiáng zhǐ zhǐ.] (《莊子·人間世》)

But the vital energy is an emptiness that is responsive to anything. The mighty Tao can only gather in an emptiness and that emptiness is the fasting of the mind. ... If you look upon everything as an emptiness, your empty mind will be pure and simple, where fortune and happiness abide. (Tr. Wang Rongpei)

Tao Qian says "after long years of abject servitude, again in nature I find homely pleasure" ("久在樊籠裏，復得返自然") (Jiǔ zài fánlóng lǐ, fù dé fǎn zìrán) and "I stay in my private room, free of worldly thoughts" ("虛室絕塵想", xū shì jué chén xiǎng). This tellingly reveals that Tao's inner world dovetails with the realm of thought described in *Chuang Tzu*. In other words, Tao's "虛室" (xū shì) would naturally and, perhaps, immediately activate the association with the metaphor "虛室" in *Chuang Tzu*. Being intertextual, Tao's "虛室" increases in implication, meaning both "my private room(s)" and "my immaculate and unoccupied heart (or mind)". In translation a, "虛室" is rendered into "my private rooms", which conveys the basic meaning, but does not show any "suggestiveness" (Eco, 1979, p. 53) of the accrued implication, and thus fails to convey the original intertextual overtone. So much the worse, Amy Lowell, the translator of a, makes a production out of "有餘閑" (yǒu yú xián, "with the leisure of moonlight through an open door"), which not only distorts the original semantic meaning, but also leads the reader ever further away from the intertextual implication, since this expression, combined with the first line "there is no dust or clatter in the courtyard before my house" ("戶庭無塵雜", hù tíng wú chén zá), merely presents a tranquil picture of a rustic life.

In translation b "虛室" is also rendered into "my private rooms", which, likewise, is not unproblematic. But the performative pattern of b, compared with the constative pattern of a, presents some "suggestiveness" of the poet's thirst for secluded life, which makes up in a way some of the insufficiency of "my private rooms" (perhaps it is better to use the singular "room"). Furthermore, "nor (should anyone) rob my private rooms of peace and leisure" may be seen, as it were, as having some metaphorical quality or flavor and, in this sense, it seems to present some association with the metaphorical "虛室" in *Chuang Tzu*.

"虛室" becomes "empty rooms" in translation c, d and e; in these translations, "empty rooms" is almost the same as "private rooms", which simply transfers the referential or superficial lexical meaning of the original "虛室", leaving its intertextual overtones unattended.

B. Sentimental Halo

Sentimental halo is a kind of emotional overtone that comes from intertexts. Let's observe the sentimental halos of “憑軒” and “啼鳥” in the following examples:

- 4) 親朋無一字，老病有孤舟。戎馬關山北，憑軒涕泗流。[Qīnpéng wú yī zì, lǎobìng yǒu gū zhōu. Róngmǎ guānshān běi, píngxuān tìsì liú] (杜甫《登岳陽樓》)
Not a word from family or friends,
Old and sick, on a solitary boat.
As the war rages on in the northern mountain passes,
Leaning on the balustrade, I cannot control my tears. (Tr. Zhang Tingchen and Wilson)

Graham says in *Poems of the Late Tang* (1965), that in translating Tu Fu's "Ascending the Yue Yang Tower" (杜甫《登岳陽樓》), he is quite dissatisfied with his last line:

As I lean on the balcony my tears stream down.

And, after a careful reconsideration, he makes up his mind to take the translation of the poem out of the book (Graham, 1965, p. 91). Because, he continues to argue, the last line would lead target readers to the assumption that "Tu Fu will on occasion speak of his feelings, or at any rate his tears, with a simplicity which falls rather flat in English" (Graham, 1965, p. 91). Here comes an interesting question: why do Tu Fu's feelings or tears turn out to be "rather flat in English" in Graham's faithful translation "As I lean on the balcony my tears stream down"? Professor Wang Zuoliang argues that the crux of the matter lies in the different emotional effects that the term “涕泗” (tisi) (“tears”) arouses in the context, namely, “涕泗” is quite emotional in Chinese while its English equivalent “tears” is rather flat (Wang, 1979, p. 60). Wang's argument might be right, but it is difficult to prove that “tears” is not semantically as strong as “涕泗” in emotional effects. In terms of intertextual approach, it seems more convincing that intertexts have given “涕泗” stronger emotional effects.

Graham is sensitive enough to have noticed the difference in poetic nuances between the Chinese original and the English translation, yet, he seems to be unable to provide a further or adequate explanation for it. It seems to us that the crux of the matter lies in the intertextual term “憑軒” (píngxuān) (“to lean on balustrade”). Semantically, “憑軒” means “to lean on a window, door, balcony, balustrade, etc.”. But pragmatically and emotionally, it is equivalent to “憑欄” (pínglán) or “倚欄杆” (yǐ lángǎn), meaning “to lean on balustrade or railings. In other words, “憑軒” generates an emotional or sentimental halo while the English translation can not. Let's observe the following intertexts related to “憑軒”:

- 5) 聞君亦多感，何處倚欄杆？[Wén jūn yì duō gǎn, hé chù yǐ lángǎn] (杜牧《初春有感寄歙州邢員外》)
Likewise you're sentimental, I hear;
But lean on balustrade, do you where? (Tr. D.R. Hale)
- 6) 細雨夢回雞塞遠，小樓吹徹玉笙寒。多少淚珠無限恨，倚欄杆。[Xì yǔ mèng huí jī sāi yuǎn, xiǎo lóu chuī chè yù shēng hán. Duōshǎo lèizhū wúxiàn hèn, yǐ lángǎn] (李憐《浣溪沙》)
In the fine rain she dreams of faraway frontiers;
Out of her bower wafts cold sound of flute of jade.
She leans with much regret and many tears on balustrade. (Tr. Xu Yuanchong)
- 7) 獨自莫憑欄，無限江山，別時容易見時難。[Dú zì mò pínglán, wúxiàn jiāngshān, bié shí róngyì jiàn shí nán] (李煜《浪淘沙》)
I'd lean upon the rail, but what's the worth?
Of hills to cross there is not dearth.
Visions of what I left so lightly bring me no more mirth. (Tr. Yang Xianyi & Gladys Yang)
- 8) 一晌憑欄人不見，鮫綃掩淚思量遍。[Yī shǎng pínglán rén bùjiàn, jiāo qī yǎn lèi sīliang biàn] (馮延巳《鵲踏枝》)
For long I lean on rails without seeing my dear;
I think of her still while I dry up tear on tear. (Tr. Xu Yuanchong)
- 9) 今何許，憑欄懷古，殘柳參差舞。[Jīn héxǔ, pínglán huáigǔ, cán liǔ cēncī wǔ] (姜夔《點絳脣》)
I long for a place
To lean on rails for reminiscences of the past.
Weeping willows are dancing in cold fierce. (Tr. H. H. Frankel)
- 10) 明月高樓休獨倚，酒入愁腸，化作相思淚。[Míngyuè gāo lóu xiū dú yǐ, jiǔ rù chóucháng, huà zuò xiāngsī lèi] (範仲淹《蘇幕遮》)
Don't lean alone on rails when the bright moon appears!
Wine in sad bowels would turn into nostalgic tears. (Tr. Xu Yuanchong)
- 11) 怒髮衝冠，憑欄處，瀟瀟雨歇。抬望眼，仰天長嘯，壯懷激烈。[Nùfàchōngguān, pínglán chù, xiāoxiǎo yǔ xiē. Tái wàng yǎn, yǎngtiān chángxiào, zhuànguáiyí jīliè] (岳飛《滿江紅》)
My hair stands up in rage, thrusts helmet to the sky,
On my porch dies down the pattering rain.
I lift my eyes, sing loud and high,
A heart that burns with anger's loyal flame. (Tr. Richard King and Alice Cheng)

- 12) 秋山春雨閑吟處，倚遍江南寺寺樓。[Qiūshān chūnyǔ xián yín chù, yǐ biàn jiāngnán sì sì lóu]
(杜牧《念昔遊》)
In autumn hills and spring rain in the places where I idly sang,
I lolled against the pillars of every monastery in Chiang-nan. (Tr. Graham)
- 13) 佇倚危樓風細細，望極春愁，黯黯生天際。草色煙光殘照裏，無言誰會憑闌意？[Zhù yǐ wēilóu fēng
xì xì, wàng jí chūnchóu, àn àn shēng tiānjì. Cǎosè yān guāng cánzhào lǐ, wúyán shuí huì píng lán yì] (柳永
《鳳棲梧》)
I lean alone on balcony in light, light breeze;
As far as the eye sees,
On the horizon dark, parting grief grows unseen.
In fading sunlight rises smoke over grass green.
Who understands why mutely on the rails I lean? (Tr. Xu Yuanchong)
- 14) 思悠悠，恨悠悠，恨到歸時方始休，月明人倚樓。[Sī yōuyōu, hèn yōuyōu, hèn dào guī shí fāngshǐ xiū,
yuè míng rén yǐ lóu] (白居易《長相思》)
My rues grow and grow,
My woes grow and grow,
Grow until comes back my yokefellow.
We lean on the rail in moonglow. (Tr. Zhao Yanchun)

“憑軒” (or “憑欄”, “倚欄杆”, “倚樓”, etc.) semantically means “to lean on balustrade (or rails, railings)”, which in itself appears quite neutral in feeling. Nevertheless, from the intertexts quoted above we can see that the act of “憑軒” is always in lockstep with strong or deep emotions. Abundant intertextuality has made “憑軒” “a proairetic code” (Silverman, 1983, p. 262) of emotiveness, or almost a pro-form of “strong sensibilities” or “mixed feelings” (Silverman, 1983, p. 263). In other words, “憑軒” is surrounded with a halo of sentiments, which may easily bring a Chinese reader into an emotional atmosphere. When it comes to the last line “憑軒涕泗流” in Tu Fu’s poem discussed above, the phrase “憑軒” paves the way for strong emotional effects that “涕泗流” (“tears stream down”) may trigger. Eco observes:

An artistic work that “suggests” is also one that can be performed with the full emotional and imaginative resources of the interpreter. Whenever we read poetry there is a process by which we try to adapt our personal world to the emotional world proposed by the text. (Eco, 1979, p. 53)

This is true of intertextual terms like “憑軒” (“lean on the balustrade”), which are emotionally suggestive, setting out to stimulate the emotional world of the reader that echoes with the subtle feelings of the poet concerned. In Tu Fu’s poem, “憑軒” functions, as it were, as a sentimental or emotional “bridge” connecting what is previously described (viz. ... 親朋無一字，老病有孤舟，戎馬關山北， meaning “not a word from my family or friends; old and sick, I’m on a solitary boat. The war rages on in the northern mountain passes”) with the climactic “憑軒涕泗流” (meaning “leaning on the balustrade, I cannot control my tears”). However, for target readers, who are devoid of the “extratextual presuppositions” or “extratextual preconceptions” (Eco, 1979, p. 53), this “bridge” is missing, and “leaning on the balustrade” (憑軒) cannot bring them into the sentimental halo, thus failing to pave the way for the originally intended climax which actually does not turn up in the English translation. That is why “tears” fall “rather flat in English”.

Zhang and Wilson’s translation, like Graham’s rendering, also fails to convey the original sentimental halo and, as a result, is not successful. Thus, Nida is right when he says “for the translator the problem exists in trying to communicate knowledge and experience by means of symbols which always involve some degree of distortion. The translator’s task can then be defined as striving for solutions which will be as functionally isomorphic as possible” (Nida, 1993, p. 165). Now let’s look at the sentimental halo involved in “啼鳥”:

- 15) 春眠不覺曉，處處聞啼鳥。[Chūnmián bù jué xiǎo, chùchù wén tíniǎo] (孟浩然《春曉》)
a) I awake light-hearted this morning of spring,
Everywhere round me the singing of birds. (Tr. Bynner)
b) I slept in spring not conscious of the dawn,
But heard the gay birds chattering all around. (Tr. Payne)
c) I scarcely knew it was dawn,
So sound was the sleep of spring;
Everywhere there was birdsong. (Tr. Shih Shun Liu)
d) How suddenly the morning comes in Spring!
On every side you hear the sweet birds sing. (Tr. Turner)
e) Sleeping in the spring, one hardly knows it’s daylight,
Birds are heard everywhere trilling. (Tr. Kung Pao)
f) Oversleeping in spring I missed the dawn;
Now everywhere the cries of birds are heard. (Tr. Zhang Tingchen & Wilson)
g) This morn of spring in bed I’m lying,
Not woke up till I hear birds crying. (Tr. Xu Yuanchong)

In translation a, b, c, d and e, “啼” (tí) is respectively translated into “singing”, “chattering”, “song”, “sing”, “trilling”, which are associated with “happiness” or “high spirits”, while in *f* and *g* “啼” is rendered into “cries” and “crying”, suggesting “sadness” or “low spirits”. Which comes closer to the original? Clues can be found from the following intertexts related to “啼 (鳥)”:

- 16) 落花寂寂啼山鳥，楊柳青青渡水人。[Guǎng wǔ chéng biān féng mùchūn, wèn yáng guī kè lèi zhān jīn. Luòhuā jì jì tí shānniǎo, yángliǔqīng qīng dù shuǐ rén.] (王維《寒食汜上作》)
The falling flowers accompany the crying mountain birds,
The green willows the traveler on the boat. (Tr. Mine)
- 17) 他鄉複行役，駐馬別孤墳。……惟見林花落，鶯啼送客聞。[Tāxiāng fù xíng yì, zhù mǎ bié gū fén. ……Wéi jiàn lín huā luò, yīng tí sòng kè wén.] (杜甫《別房太尉墓》)
Before I'm on a mission in a distant land again,
I stop my horse to bid adieu to the lonely grave. ...
I only see flowers falling in the forest,
Hearing an oriole crying farewell to me. (Tr. Mine)
- 18) 感時花濺淚，恨別鳥驚心。[Gǎn shí huā jiàn lèi, hèn bié niǎo jīng xīn.] (杜甫《春望》)
In grief for the times, a tear the flower stains,
In woe for such parting, the birds fly from thence. (Tr. W. J. B. Fletcher)
- 19) 山城過雨百花盡，榕葉滿庭鶯亂啼。[Shānchéngguò yǔ bǎihuā jìn, róng yè mǎntíng yīng luàn tí.] (柳宗元《柳州二月榕葉落盡偶題》)
After the rain, all the flowers in the mountain city have fallen,
The banyan leaves in the courtyard hear an oriole crying. (Tr. Mine)
- 20) 唱到竹枝聲咽處，寒猿晴鳥一時啼。[Chàng dào zhúzhī shēng yàn chù, hán yuán qíng niǎo yīshí tí.] (白居易《竹枝》)
When her singing reaches the saddest point,
The monkeys and birds cry simultaneously. (Tr. Mine)
- 21) 日暮東風怨啼鳥，落花猶似墜樓人。[Rì mù dōngfēng yuàn tíniǎo, luòhuā yóu sì zhuì lóu rén.] (杜牧《金穀園》)
Dusk comes, the east wind blows, and birds pipe forth a mournful sound;
Petals, like nymphs from balconies, come tumbling to the ground. (Tr. Herbert A. Giles)
- 22) 鶯啼如有淚，為濕最高花。[Yīng tí rú yǒu lèi, wèi shī zuìgāo huā.] (李商隱《天涯》)
The oriole's cry seems to have tears, wetting the flower in the highest branch. (Tr. Mine)
- 23) 江雨菲菲江草齊，六朝如夢鳥空啼。[Jiāng yǔ fēifēi jiāngcǎo qí, liùcháo rú mèng niǎo kōng tí.] (韋莊《臺城》)
The rain on the river is heavy and the grass by the river is tall,
The Six Dynasties are like a dream and the birds are crying in vain. (Tr. Mine)
- 24) 啼鳥還知如許恨，料不啼淚長啼血。[Tíniǎo hái zhī rúxǔ hèn, liào bù tí lèi zhǎng tí xuè.] (辛棄疾《別茂嘉十二弟》)
The crying birds know how much hatred there is,
But they don't cry tears, but only blood. (Tr. Mine)
- 25) 月落鳥啼霜滿天，江風漁火對愁眠。[Yuè luò wū tí shuāng mǎn tiān, jiāng fēng yúhuǒ duì chóumián.] (張繼《楓橋夜泊》)
The moon sets, a crow caws,
Frost fills the sky.
Maple leaves fall on the river.
The fisherman's fires keep me awake. (Tr. Kenneth Rexroth)

After scrutinizing the above intertexts, we would find that “啼 (鳥)” is linked with sad sentiments or low spirits. And it's very likely that the poet, Meng Haoran (孟浩然), was releasing his depression or melancholy in the original because a) he failed to become a *Jinshi* (進士, successful candidate in the highest imperial civil service examination in ancient China) at the age of forty, and, consequently, b) failed to be an office-holder though he had been an office-hunter for long, and c) what he depicted is a picture of melancholy scene as can be seen from the lines that follow in the poem “夜來風雨聲，花落知多少” (meaning “after one night of wind and showers, how many are the fallen flowers?”). Thus, it is safe to say that translation *f* and *g* are closer to the original.

Now let's look at another example. “楊柳” (yángliǔ, willow, or willow twig) in the following poems is intertextual and the intertexts generate an overtone of melancholy or nostalgia:

- 26) 上馬不捉鞭，反折楊柳枝。蹀座吹長笛，愁煞行客兒。[Shàng mǎ bù zhuā biān, fǎn zhé yángliǔ zhī. Dié zuò chuī chángdí, chóu shā xíng kè er.] (樂府·折楊柳歌詞)
He did not hold the whip when he mounted his horse,

But broke willow branches instead.
He sat on the horse and played the flute,
Which made other travelers sad. (Tr. Mine)

- 27) 羌笛何須怨楊柳，春風不度玉門關。[Qiāngdí héxū yuàn yángliǔ, chūnfēng bù dù yùménguān] (王之渙《涼州詞》)

Why does the Qiang flute complain about willows?
For spring breeze never crosses the Jade Gate. (Tr. Botao Liu)

- 28) 此夜曲中聞楊柳，何人不起故園情。[Cǐ yèqǔ zhōng wén yángliǔ, hérén bù qǐ gùyuán qíng.] (李白《春夜洛城聞笛》)

Tonight if we should hear the willow-breaking song,
Who could help but long for the gardens of home? (Tr. Burton Watson)

- 29) 春風知別苦，不遣柳條青。[Chūnfēng zhī bié kǔ, bù qiǎn liǔtiáo qīng.] (李白《勞勞亭》)

The spring breeze knows the pain of parting,
So it does not let the willow branches turn green. (Tr. Mine)

- 30) 忽見陌頭楊柳色，悔教夫婿覓封侯。[Hū jiàn mò tóu yángliǔ sè, huǐ jiào fūjūn mì shí.] (王昌齡《閨怨》)

Sudden she sees the willow-trees their newest green put on,
And sighs for her husband far away in search of glory gone. (Tr. Herbert A. Giles)

- 31) 渭城朝雨悵輕塵，客舍青青柳色新。勸君更進一杯酒，西出陽關無故人。[Wèichéng cháo yǔ yì qīng chén, kè shě qīngqīng liǔsè xīn. Quàn jūn gèng jìn yībēi jiǔ, xī chū yáng guān wúgù.] (王維《渭城曲》)

Light rain is on the light dust,
The willows of the inn-yard
Will be going greener and greener,
But you, Sir, had better take wine ere your departure,
For you will have no friends about you
When you come to the gates of Go. (Tr. Ezra Pound)

In classic Chinese poems, “楊柳” (willow, or willow twig), or “折楊柳” (zhé yángliǔ, breaking a willow twig or picking a willow twig) is taken as a token of nostalgia or missing one’s friends or lover. It is a tradition that started in the Han Dynasty (202 BC -8) in China, where willow twigs were presented to those who were leaving for a faraway place. As seen in example 26, it first appeared as a phrase “折楊柳枝” (zhé yángliǔ zhī, breaking a willow twig) in *Yuefu Songs* (《樂府》) of the Han Dynasty. Being an act that often took place on an occasion to see a friend (or friends) off, it was tinged with a touch of melancholy or sadness, which influenced the later-on intertexts. What is notable is that this culture-loaded act was composed into a piece of touching classical music called *Willow Songs* (see “怨楊柳 yuàn yángliǔ” and “聞楊柳 wén yángliǔ” in example 27 and 28), which intensified the implication of melancholy or nostalgia.

C. Intersubjective Validity

In this section, intersubjective validity refers to the resonance or affinity between the writer, the translator, and the reader. Let’s look at the translations of “東籬”(dōnglí, the east fence) in the following poems:

- 32) 東籬把酒黃昏後，有暗香盈袖。[Dōnglí bǎjiǔ huánghūn hòu, yǒu àn xiāng yíng xiù] (李清照《醉花陰》)

- a) With the evening almost gone,
I sip my wine near the east fence,
Where chrysanthemums are in bloom.
My sleeves hold a slight fragrance thence. (Tr. Xu Zhongjie)

- b) At dusk I drink before chrysanthemums in bloom;
My sleeves are filled with fragrance and with gloom. (Tr. Xu Yuanchong)

In translation *a* “東籬” is “the east fence”, while in *b* “東籬” is “chrysanthemums in bloom”. Which is a better choice? We may find some clue from an intertext in Tao Qian’s poem “Drinking Wine” (《飲酒》):

- 33) 采菊東籬下，悠然見南山。[Cǎi jú dōnglí xià, yōurán jiàn nánshān] (陶潛《飲酒》):

Picking chrysanthemums under the eastern fence;
Leisurely I look up and see the Southern Mountains. (Tr. Roland Fang)

Tao’s “Drinking Wine” consists of ten lines, among which the quoted two are the best-known, representative of the poet’s love for nature and freedom. The chrysanthemum for which the poet has a predilection is a representative cold-proof flower that blooms in autumn, it becomes a symbol of lofty beauty in a hostile environment, and the Southern Mountains (or Mount Lu) become a symbol of nobility, tranquility, longevity and eternity. And, consequently, the poet’s love of chrysanthemums and mountains reveals his own personality: trying to be as lofty or noble as chrysanthemums, and as tranquil and lasting as mountains. Interestingly, perhaps owing to the fact that, in Tao Qian’s poem, the image of “東籬” is in contiguity with the image of “chrysanthemums” and the image of “the Southern Mountains”, the term “東籬” is chosen by posterior poets as a “prompter” (Nida, 1982, p. 56) of all imaginative associations with poet Tao Qian, particularly his reclusive life and his personality (cf. Yuan, 1987, p. 14). Thus, the term “東籬” becomes a “perceptual

phenomenon conveying unique meanings of intersubjective validity” (Cluysenaar, 1976, p. 7). In this context, “intersubjective validity” refers to the resonance or affinity that is only intelligible to readers with the same or similar cultural background as the poet. In other words, it may not be difficult for Chinese readers to understand the intertextual overtones of “東籬” like:

- a) the eastern fence or fence in general\chrysanthemums
- b) a patch of land (or garden) where only chrysanthemums are grown.
- c) secluded spot
- d) secluded life
- e) Tao Qian as a famous recluse idyllist
- f) unworldly spirit

Moreover, the following intertexts reinforce the overtones:

- 34) 為報使君多泛菊，更將弦管醉東籬。[Wèi bào shǐ jūn duō fàn jú, gèng jiāng xián guǎn zuì dōnglí.] (岑參《九日使君席奉錢衛中丞赴長水》)
To requite the envoy for sending me chrysanthemums,
I invite him to drink by the eastern fence with music played. (Tr. Mine)
- 35) 從來菊花節，早已醉東籬。[Cónglái júhuā jié, zǎoyǐ zuì dōnglí.] (劉昫《九日送人》)
At Double Ninth Day each year,
We before the chrysanthemums pleasurably drink. (Tr. Gaunt)
- 36) 空煩左手持新蟹，漫繞東籬嗅落英。[Kōng fán zuǒshǒu chí xīn xiè, màn rào dōnglí xiù luòyīng.] (蘇軾《戲章質夫寄酒不至》)
I hold a new crab in my left hand,
Walking around the eastern fence sniffing the fallen chrysanthemums. (Tr. Mine)
- 37) 東籬把酒黃昏後，有暗香盈袖。[Dōnglí bǎjiǔ huánghūn hòu, yǒu àn xiāng yíng xiù.] (See example 32)
At dusk I drink by the east fence,
Chrysanthemum fragrance filling my sleeves. (Tr. Mine)

Posterior intertexts like the ones from example 34 to 37, on the one hand, make “東籬” the “prompter” and, on the other hand, reinforce or consolidate the “intersubjective validity” between Chinese poets and readers. With the consolidation of the “intersubjective validity”, a “direct connection” has been established between “東籬” (seen as an intertextual sign or cultural code) and its overtones. And such terms “function not only to organize but to naturalize that field -- to make it seem timeless and inevitable. They also assure that future textual production will be congruent with what has gone before” (Silverman, 1983, p. 274).

In terms of the analyses above, the “東籬” in example 32, on the one hand, implies a place where the poetess sips her wine, and, on the other hand, may be seen as the “prompter” of all overtones listed above. In a word, it is a poetical, suggestive and multi-faceted term. Chinese readers may be able to appreciate its poeticalness, suggestiveness and multi-facetedness, and experience a kind of “reading jouissance” (Barthes, 1968; Scholes, 1982, p. 51). By contrast, most English readers, because of the lack of the “intersubjective validity” concerned, are generally unable to appreciate the intertextual values or experience the “reading jouissance”. Perhaps the best thing for a translator to do is to follow the minimax principle, namely, to minimize the loss that can be suffered even under the worst circumstances.

In translation *a*, “東籬” is rendered into two interrelated parts: “(near) the east fence” (the semantic meaning) and “where chrysanthemums are in bloom” (an overtone or associative meaning), which, though seemingly a little wordy, is on the whole necessary. Particularly commendable is the addition of the phrase “in bloom”, which prepares the reader for the understanding of “my sleeves hold a slight fragrance”, and it also suggests that “the Double Ninth Day or Chrysanthemum Day now comes again” (佳節又重陽).

In translation *b*, “東籬” is translated into “before chrysanthemums in bloom”, where the basic meaning (*i.e.* a place where the poetess drinks at dusk) is artistically mixed with a major associative meaning or overtone (*i.e.* chrysanthemums), and the added “in bloom” achieves the same artistic effects as that in translation *a*. Hence, the translation is also acceptable.

III. CONCLUSION

Intertextuality is an effective instrument that can be employed to examine and detect the elusive overtones suggested in the intertexts of a word or term. These overtones are so important to Chinese classic poetic lines that they are actually the “eyes” or “souls” of the poems. An intertextual approach to Chinese classic poems may enable us to have a better understanding of the poems, and it may also enable a translator to find the poetic eyes and catch the poetic souls of the originals. Through scrutinizing the overtones suggested in intertexts from aspects of “implication accretion”, “sentimental halo”, and “intersubjective validity”, we find that intertextual overtones are of great importance to classical Chinese poems, and translators should pay special attention to them.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work reported here is part of the research project supported by a Macao Polytechnic University Research Grant (Project No. RP/FLT-07/2022 entitled: “A cognitive approach to culture-loaded words: construal and reconstructing in translation”).

REFERENCES

- [1] Allen, Graham. (2011). *Intertextuality (2nd Edition)*. London & New York: Routledge.
- [2] Barthes, Roland. (1968). *Elements of Semiology*. New York: Hill and Wang.
- [3] Barthes, Roland. (1970). *S/Z*. London: Cape.
- [4] Cluysenaar, Anne. (1976). *Introduction to Literary Stylistics*. London: Batsford.
- [5] Eco, Umberto. (1979). *A Theory of Semiotics*. Indiana: Indiana University Press.
- [6] Graham, Angus Charles. (1965). *Poems of the Late Tang*. New York: Penguin.
- [7] Hatim, Basil., & Mason, Ian. (1990). *Discourse and the Translator*. London and New York: Longman.
- [8] Irwin, W. (2004). Against Intertextuality. *Philosophy and Literature*, 28(2), 227-242.
- [9] Kristeva, Julia. (1969). *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- [10] Lemke, Jay. (1985). “Ideology, intertextuality, and the notion of register”. In *Systematic Perspectives on Discourse, Vol. 1*, ed. by Bensen and Greaves, 67-79. New Jersey: Ablex.
- [11] Nida, Eugene. (1982). *Translating Meaning*. California: English Language Institute Press.
- [12] Nida, E. (1993). *Language, Culture, and Translating*. Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.
- [13] Panagiotidou, Maria-Eirini. (2011). *Intertextuality and literary Reading: A cognitive approach* (Doctoral dissertation). University of Nottingham.
- [14] Scholes, Robert. (1982). *Semiotics and Interpretation*. Mass: Yale University Press.
- [15] Sebeok, Thomas., & Denesi, Marcel. (1988). *Encyclopedic Dictionary of Semiotics (Third Edition)*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- [16] Silverman, Kaja. (1983). *The Subject of Semiotics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- [17] Wang, Yichuan. (1995). *Language Utopia*. Kunming: Yunnan People’s Press.
- [18] Wang, Zuoliang. (1979). *Degrees of Affinity*. Beijing: Beijing Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press.
- [19] Yuan, Xingpei. (1987). *A Study of the Art of Chinese Poetry*. Beijing: Peking University Press.



Xiaohua Jiang received his Ph.D. from Peking University in 1996, majoring in translation studies.

He was a visiting scholar in GSTI, Monterey Institute of International Studies (California) from 2000 through 2001, served as External Examiner of the Translation Department of Lingnan University of Hong Kong, now a professor of Translation Studies in Faculty of Languages and Translation in Macao Polytechnic University, co-supervisor of Ph.D. candidates in Guangdong University of Foreign Studies.

Prof. Jiang is the editor of the academic journal *Guang Yi* (ISSN1998-5177), Supervisor-general of the Federation of Translators and Interpreters of Macao, and Secretary-general of the International Association for Eco-Translatology. He has been teaching English, translation theory, and practice for over 30 years. He has published 2 translated books, 2 monographs, and over 80 academic papers on Translation Studies. Email: xhjiang@mpu.edu.mo